STATE OF CALIFORNIA
Budget Change Proposal - Cover Sheet
DF-46 (REV 08/15)

Fiscal Year	Business Unit	Department	Priority No.
16-17	3790	Parks and Recreation	3

Budget Request Name	Program	Subprogram
3790-003-BCP-DP-2016-GB	**2840**	

Budget Request Description
Goat Canyon Sediment Basin Maintenance

Budget Request Summary

The Department of Parks and Recreation (Department) requests two-year funding of $1,886,000 annually from the California Tire Recycling Management Fund beginning in Fiscal Year 2016-17 to maintain the Goat Canyon Sediment Basins at Border Field State Park (BFSP) by excavating and processing sediment and trash, disposing trash and reject material, exporting sediment, testing and monitoring of contaminants and conditions, and maintenance of infrastructure.

Requires Legislation	Code Section(s) to be Added/Amended/Repealed
☐ Yes ☒ No	

Does this BCP contain information technology (IT) components? ☐ Yes ☒ No *If yes, departmental Chief Information Officer must sign.*	Department CIO	Date

For IT requests, specify the date a Special Project Report (SPR) or Feasibility Study Report (FSR) was approved by the Department of Technology, or previously by the Department of Finance.

☐ FSR ☐ SPR Project No. Date:

If proposal affects another department, does other department concur with proposal? ☐ Yes ☐ No
Attach comments of affected department, signed and dated by the department director or designee.

Prepared By	Date	Reviewed By	Date
Chris Peregrin	12/21/15	Jordan Burgum	12-31-15
Department Director	**Date**	**Agency Secretary**	**Date**
	12-31-15		12/31/15

Department of Finance Use Only

Additional Review: ☐ Capital Outlay ☐ ITCU ☐ FSCU ☐ OSAE ☐ CALSTARS ☐ Dept. of Technology

BCP Type: ☐ Policy ☐ Workload Budget per Government Code 13308.05

PPBA	Date submitted to the Legislature
Original Signed by Amanda Martin	1-8-16

BCP Fiscal Detail Sheet

BCP Title: Goat Canyon

DP Name: 3790-015-BCP-DP-2016-GB

Budget Request Summary

	FY16					
	CY	BY	BY+1	BY+2	BY+3	BY+4
Operating Expenses and Equipment						
5340 - Consulting and Professional Services - External	0	1,886	1,886	0	0	0
Total Operating Expenses and Equipment	**$0**	**$1,886**	**$1,886**	**$0**	**$0**	**$0**
Total Budget Request	**$0**	**$1,886**	**$1,886**	**$0**	**$0**	**$0**

Fund Summary

Fund Source - State Operations						
0226 - California Tire Recycling Management Fund	0	1,886	1,886	0	0	0
Total State Operations Expenditures	**$0**	**$1,886**	**$1,886**	**$0**	**$0**	**$0**
Total All Funds	**$0**	**$1,886**	**$1,886**	**$0**	**$0**	**$0**

Program Summary

Program Funding						
2840 - Support of the Department of Parks and Recreation	0	1,886	1,886	0	0	0
Total All Programs	**$0**	**$1,886**	**$1,886**	**$0**	**$0**	**$0**

Supplemental Information

(Dollars in thousands)

BCP No.	Proposal Title
3790-003-BCP-DP-2016-GB	Goat Canyon Sediment Basin Maintenance

Equipment	CY	BY	BY +1
Total	$0	$0	$0

Consulting & Professional Services

Excavate 40,000 cubic yards of sediment and trash		363	363
Sort and haul off 38,000 cubic yards of trash and sediment		1,463	1,463
Contaminants and conditions testing and monitoring		60	60
Total	$0	$1,886	$1,886

Facility/Capital Costs

Total	$0	$0	$0

One-Time/Limited-Term Costs Yes ☐ No ☐

Description	BY		BY +1		BY +2	
	Positions	Dollars	Positions	Dollars	Positions	Dollars
	0.0	$0	0.0	$0	0.0	$0

Full-Year Cost Adjustment Yes ☐ No ☐

Provide the incremental change in dollars and positions by fiscal year.

Item Number	BY		BY +1		BY +2	
	Positions	Dollars	Positions	Dollars	Positions	Dollars
Total	0.0	$0	0.0	$0	0.0	$0

Future Savings Yes ☐ No ☐

Specify fiscal year and estimated savings, including any decrease in positions.

Item Number	BY		BY +1		BY +2	
	Positions	Dollars	Positions	Dollars	Positions	Dollars
Total	0.0	$0	0.0	$0	0.0	$0

A. Budget Request Summary

The Department of Parks and Recreation (Department) requests two-year funding of $1,886,000 annually from the California Tire Recycling Management Fund beginning in Fiscal Year (FY) 2016-17 to maintain the Goat Canyon Sediment Basins (Sediment Basins) at Border Field State Park (BFSP) by excavating and processing sediment and trash, disposing trash and reject material, exporting sediment, testing and monitoring of contaminants and conditions, and maintenance of facilities. The two-year funding will allow the Department to complete the report on alternative funding sources that is due to the Legislature in September 2016.

The Department constructed the Sediment Basins in 2005 on the international border of Mexico within BFSP and the Tijuana River National Estuarine Research Reserve (TRNERR); the Sediment Basins protect one of our nation's most significant wetland habitats-- the Tijuana Estuary.

The Tijuana Estuary within BFSP is critically threatened by sedimentation and trash, primarily from Mexico. When uncontrolled, sediment and trash smother the saltmarsh habitat, alter the estuary's natural hydrologic processes, and pollute the environment. In addition to sediment, these cross-border flows can deposit large volumes of waste tires, plastic debris, and other trash, creating conditions of chronic pollution from domestic and industrial discharges. The Sediment Basins capture sediment, trash, and polluted water upstream of the Tijuana Estuary.

When the Department planned for the construction of the Sediment Basins, it was anticipated that the sediment captured would have a significant market value as construction fill, which would off-set the maintenance costs. Subsequently, economic factors have significantly reduced the demand for construction fill. More significantly, the quality of the material as a construction product has been far lower than anticipated. Over $8 million has been spent directly on basin management by the Department through one-time grants and funding from other special interest groups since the construction of the Sediment Basins in 2005.

Background/History

Resource History
(Dollars in thousands)

Program Budget	PY - 2	PY - 1	PY
Authorized Expenditures	0	1,001	1,001
Actual Expenditures	662	874	914

The Department funded the construction of the Sediment Basins with costs of nearly $6 million. Since their completion in 2005, the Sediment Basins have successfully protected the Tijuana Estuary. The Sediment Basins are currently in good condition, and given adequate maintenance funding, they are anticipated to successfully protect the Tijuana Estuary from sediment and trash for years to come.

Annual maintenance funding has been very challenging to obtain, and as a result, the workload varies annually. In Fiscal Year (FY) 2013-14, the Department received funding from the State Parks and Recreation Fund (SPRF) of $1,001,000 per year for three years through a Budget Change Proposal. According to the report from the Legislative Analyst's Office, The 2013-14 Budget: Resources and Environmental Protection, the Department is not responsible for the accumulation of trash in the Border Fields State Park, and therefore, SPRF should not be the sole source of funding for the maintenance of the basins. In addition, SPRF cannot sustain the ongoing funds at the requested level, thus the Department seeks funding from the California Tire Recycling Management Fund. Prior to FY 2013-14, sufficient funds were typically not available to accomplish all required maintenance actions. Therefore, tasks such as sediment processing, contaminants and conditions monitoring, maintenance of infrastructure, and sediment export were deferred until adequate funding was acquired, resulting in highly-variable costs and workload from year to year. Because the Sediment Basins are within a State Park with significant natural and cultural resources, space is limited, and deferral of project tasks is not possible beyond two to three years without significant resource damage. For more details on the Sediment Basin maintenance history, see the Sediment Basin Maintenance History Table, attached.

State Level Considerations

Since 1985, over $25 million of State funding has been invested in this important resource area by multiple state entities with an interest in resource protection. The Goat Canyon Sediment Basin implementation and maintenance program was developed to protect this valued resource in accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act. The Sediment Basins are operated under permits from the US Army Corps of Engineers and the CA Regional Water Quality Control Board.

Sediment and trash discharges into waters of the State are regulated by the California State Water Resources Control Board (Water Board) under section 13385 of the California Water Code, Division 7 (Porter Cologne Water Quality Control Act). The Department owns and manages the land on which the Sediment Basins are located, and the Department constructed the Sediment Basins. Therefore, the Department may be fined millions of dollars per storm event if annual Sediment Basin maintenance is not accomplished.

The Sediment Basin maintenance fits clearly within the Mission, Core Programs, Values, Vision and Outcomes set forth in the Department's Seventh Generation Report: The Strategic Vision of California State Parks and the California State Parks Performance Management Report. The mission of the Department is "to provide for the health, inspiration and education of the people of California by helping to preserve the state's extraordinary biological diversity, protecting its most valued natural and cultural resources, and creating opportunities for high-quality outdoor recreation." Additionally, the TRNERR Comprehensive Management Plan (June 2010) describes the sediment and trash management issue and develops the need for resolution throughout the Vision, Goals, and Objectives identified in this plan.

Justification

Annual Sediment Basin maintenance is critical for the health of the Tijuana Estuary and for continued public access. Nearly 40,000 people visit the Tijuana Estuary each year. It is the last un-bisected coastal wetland in urban Southern California and Northern Baja. As such, it is not only an important publicly-accessible, natural, open-space oasis in a sea of development, it is also the last place where natural hydrologic processes have the opportunity to take place. In addition, healthy estuaries play a vital role in countering the effects of climate change. For example, salt marshes sequester much greater amounts of carbon than forest ecosystems.

California has lost over 90% of its coastal wetlands. These wetlands play a key role in the life-cycle of marine fisheries. For example, estuaries serve as nurseries for growing halibut. In California, in spite of dramatic declines over the past decades, the marine fishing industry still accounts for over 120,000 jobs and over $20 million in sales. This industry depends on both the protection of coastal wetlands to maintain its current productivity and the restoration of coastal wetlands for future growth. Among rivers, bays, meadows and marshes throughout the United States, it is one of only 27 wetlands that have been designated as a "Wetland of International Importance" by the international Ramsar Convention.

Further, the Tijuana Estuary is a key link in the Pacific flyway. Over 370 bird species have been sighted here, making it a popular destination for birdwatchers from around the world. Local cities and counties are fully embracing the TRNERR as the key element in economic development strategies to capture ecotourism dollars. TRNERR contributes $560,000 in federal funding in education relief value to local and state budgets through its education programs, which have educated over 16,000 students through more than 150 events.

The Department has been both very creative and extremely fortunate to-date in funding the Sediment Basin maintenance. However, all potential partners have been exhausted, and all possible special funding sources available have been tapped out. This proposal includes the annual costs that are essential for complete maintenance of the Sediment Basins. Without this allocation, the Department not only risks potential penalties and clean-up costs associated with uncontrolled flows, but may face

the loss of ecosystem function in the Tijuana Estuary, arguably Southern California's most significant coastal wetland.

There is a high-priority long-term need to protect the Tijuana Estuary until the erosion and trash control issues are resolved in Mexico. The requested amount has been assessed based on seven years of experience conducting Sediment Basin Maintenance. If the proposal is not approved, fines to the Department totaling up to $10 million from a single winter storm are possible. Unauthorized discharges of "waste" (sediment and trash) to waters of the State are regulated by the Water Board under section 13385 of the California Water Code, Division 7 (Porter Cologne Water Quality Control Act). Without annual maintenance, trash and sediment would flow into the Tijuana Estuary, resulting in a possible $10,000/day penalty until the waste is cleaned up. A clean-up construction project could take nearly 400 days, assuming permitting (8 months), bidding (3 months), and construction (3 months), totaling fines of nearly $4,000,000. Additionally, cleanup cost (at $300,000/acre) would range from $3 million for 10 acres to $6 million for 20 acres (acreage based on annual sediment capture volumes and observations of storm damage prior to Sediment Basin construction and estuary restoration).

In addition to maintaining the Sediment Basins, the Department is addressing the problem at the source by providing significant leadership in the Tijuana River Valley Recovery Team (Recovery Team), a multi-agency collaborative effort with a primary objective of controlling sediment and trash in the Tijuana River Valley in Mexico. Resolution of the problem in Mexico will likely take many years. Until then, the Department must protect the Tijuana Estuary through annual maintenance of the Sediment Basins.

E. Outcomes and Accountability

General accountability is well ensured in all programs, operations, and activities. Numerous controls, processes, and procedures are in place to ensure that contracts are met and deliverables are provided. Current programmatic controls for the Department include use of CALSTARS expenditure data to monitor and track (by fund source) monthly by the Department's staff, supervisors and managers.

Projected Outcomes

Workload Measure	CY	BY	BY+1	BY+2	BY+3	BY+4
Cubic Yards Sediment and Trash Excavated and Processed	20,000	40,000	40,000	40,000	40,000	40,000
Cubic Yards Sediment and Trash Exported	20,000	38,000	38,000	38,000	38,000	38,000
Maintenance of Infrastructure	Facility efficiency	Facility efficiency	Facility efficiency	Facility efficiency	Facility efficiency	Facility efficiency
Contaminants and Conditions Testing and Monitoring	Regulatory conformance and efficiency	Regulatory conformance and efficiency	Regulatory conformance and efficiency	Regulatory conformance and efficiency	Regulatory conformance and efficiency	Regulatory conformance and efficiency

F. Analysis of All Feasible Alternatives

The following alternatives are considered:

Alternative 1: Fund Goat Canyon Sediment Basin Maintenance Proposal for $1,886,000 from the California Tire Recycling Management Fund

This alternative will allow the Department to maintain the Sediment Basins by excavating and processing sediment and trash, disposing trash and reject material, exporting sediment, and testing and monitoring contaminants. Accomplishing these tasks on an annual basis will enable the Department to protect the Tijuana Estuary, which is one of our nation's most valued wetland resources. It will also ensure that the Department avoids penalties of up to $10 million per storm event for uncontrolled discharges of sediment and trash into waters of the United States.

Alternative 2: Do Not Fund Goat Canyon Sediment Basin Maintenance, Continue to Seek Special Funds, Grants, etc.

In the past, the Department has been successful at acquiring funding to manage the Sediment Basins to-date. However, the Department feels it has exhausted its partnering opportunities, and without a committed annual maintenance budget, continued successful maintenance of the Sediment Basins is not possible. Clean-out of the Sediment Basins is a maintenance project, and there is very little interest from potential funders and partners to contribute toward maintenance projects. Other groups that have funded Sediment Basin maintenance on the Department's behalf are reluctant to continue to provide maintenance funds, stating that they have contributed their share and that it is the Department's responsibility to continue.

Alternative 3: Partially Fund Goat Canyon Sediment Basin Maintenance Proposal

The Department has been successful at acquiring funding for managing the Sediment Basins to-date; therefore, it may be suggested that a reduced allocation is appropriate and the Department will be successful at acquiring additional funds in the future to make up the needed difference. A reduced allocation highly increases the probability that the Department will see valuable coastal resources lost and incur millions of dollars in fines. Due to the significance of the Tijuana Estuary, a partially-funded alternative is not considered feasible. The potential loss of valued resources and possible fines and remediation costs (up to $10 million per storm event) out-weigh the savings the Department would realize by not funding this maintenance.

G. Implementation Plan

In order to meet the program needs as detailed above, the effective of the program augmentation needs to begin July 1, 2016.

H. Supplemental Information

See attached Goat Canyon Sediment Basin History Table.

Recommendation

Approve Alternative 1: Fund Goat Canyon Sediment Basin Maintenance Proposal for $1,886,000, as requested. This alternative will allow the Department to maintain the Sediment Basins by excavating and processing sediment and trash, disposing trash and reject material, exporting sediment, and testing and monitoring contaminants, thus avoiding possible future fines.

Sediment Basin Maintenance History Table August 2015

Maintenance Event	Basin Volume (Cubic yards)	Scope of Work	Cost*	Funding Source**
Winter 2005	55,000	• Excavate basins, haul to landfill	$1.1 million	CWCB, CCC
Fall 2005	35,000	• Excavate basins, haul to pad; • Process and own desired re-usable material; • Leave rejected material on pad.	$37,500.00	DPR
Fall 2006	25,000	• Excavate basins, haul to pad; • Process and own desired re-usable material; • Leave rejected material on pad.	$54,000.00	DPR
Fall 2007	25,000	• Excavate basins, haul to pad; • Leave material on pad unsorted.	$67,500.00	DPR
Fall 2008	40,000	• Excavate basins, haul to pad; • Process 60,000cy for sand/silt and haul 1.5 miles to beach for ocean deposition; • Improve 0.5 miles of haul road; • Leave rejected material on pad.	$1 million	CCC, USEPA, CBW
Fall 2009	60,000	• Excavate basins, haul to pad; • Process 60,000cy for sand/silt, rock, trash; Haul off-site • Purchase and install trash-boom system; • Haul 5 years worth of rejected material off-site (roughly 40,000cy).	$2.5 million	CalRecycle
Fall 2010	55,000	• Excavate basins, haul to pad; • Process 5,000cy for sand and silt and haul off-site.	$239,500.00	DPR
Fall 2011	50,000	• Excavate basins, haul to pad	$380,000.00	US IBWC
Fall 2012	45,000	• Excavate basins, haul to pad; • Process 30,000cy for trash removal. • Initiate plastics/sediment study	~$800,000.00	CalRecycle, CSP, City of SD USEPA
Fall 2013	15,000	• Excavate 15,000cy from basins and process for sand and silt. • Haul 13,600cy sand and silt off-site • Leave rejected material on pad	$310,000.00	CSP
Fall 2014	35,000	• Haul off 35,000cy sediment and trash	$860,920.00	CSP

		• Repair upper trash boom		
Fall 2015 (in progress)	20,000	• Excavate 20,000cy from basin • Haul-off 20,000cy of sediment and trash • Haul-off 400cy trash • Improve trash boom	$898,367.00	CSP, NOAA

* Reported costs do not include DPR staff time and various other expenses. Due to multi-element ocean-deposition project 2008 and 2009 costs not complete representation of all work associated with basin management.

** CWCB = CA Wildlife Conservation Board; DPR = CA Department of Parks and Recreation; CCC= CA Coastal Conservancy; USEPA = US Environmental Protection Agency; CBW = CA Department of Boating and Waterways; CalRecycle = CA Department of Resources Recycling and Recovery; US IBWC = US International Boundary and Water Commission.; NOAA = National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration